| **Student Name:** Ivy Xu |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house believes that criminal justice policy should be decided by technocrats rather than elected representatives |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 6 minutes’ long.]  As the member speaker, we need to explicitly frame why our extension is unique, AND better than the opening contribution. So don’t dive into the material without doing this.   * On tackling corruption, while I accept that these are things that can be checked and balanced, we need this response to be nuanced to CG’s specific problem. They argued that the prison industrial complex is the actor influencing the government to pass bad laws, how does your counterfactual deal with this specific problem?   + Highlight that your OO never specified specific mechanisms of check and balance, so CO claims the credit for this contribution!   Excellent job reinforcing biased data being the baseline for these terrible policies.   * But what is the grounding of terrible criminal justice policies that become the byproduct of bad data? What is the biased data?   + I can only accept the impact of cyclical discrimination if the mechanistic analysis holds true.   What is the actual case framing on better representation? Why exactly do criminal justice policies need public buy-in order to have any kind of effectiveness?  Good defense that we can hold politicians accountable for making bad decisions.   * But this only exists in theory, what is the grounding for when this mechanism is effective? * We should actively defend what are the necessary qualifications for public policy makers. They do not need to be expertise, but just be democratically representative of what the people want. * It would be better if we can point out that technocrats also exist on Opp, but why politicians will actively have an incentive to listen to them.   While I appreciate the defense of democratic choices, it is not clear why any of this engages with Prop’s point on the EFFECTIVENESS of criminal justice policies:   * Why do they still pass tough on crime laws despite its ineffectiveness? * In what way do tough on crime laws actually do anything positive in the realm of criminal justice? * We need to address the voter prejudices that Prop argued.   + Why will voters be objective and value effectiveness over their prejudices?   We’re entering the extension too late at the 5th minute!   * On bad data, you’ve already argued this in the rebuttal!   + It isn’t clear why technocrats adapt worse than politicians! They presumably can do this faster!   + The analysis on accountability has also been said in rebuttals already.   Please offer more POIs today!  6.35 - Watch for time! | | | | | | |